

1 **The TeRiFiQ project: Combining technologies to achieve**
2 **significant binary reductions in sodium, fat and sugar**
3 **content in everyday foods whilst optimising their nutritional**
4 **quality**

5

6 **Short running head: The TeRiFiQ project**

7

8 **C. Salles*¹, J.R. Kerjean², E. Veiseth-Kent³, M. Stieger⁴, P. Wilde⁵, C. Cotillon⁶**
9 **and on the behalf of the *TeRiFiQ* consortium**

10 ¹CSGA (Centre des Sciences du goût et de l'Alimentation), AgroSup Dijon ; CNRS, INRA,
11 Université de Bourgogne Franche-Comté, Dijon, France

12 ²ACTALIA, Rennes, France

13 ³NOFIMA As, Ås, Norway

14 ⁴Wageningen University, Division of Human Nutrition, Wageningen, The Netherlands

15 ⁵Institute of Food Research, Norwich, UK

16 ⁶ACTIA, Paris, France

17

18 Correspondance: Dr Christian Salles, INRA, CSGA, 17 rue Sully, 21000 Dijon, France.

19 E-mail: Christian.salles@inra.fr

20

21

22

23 **Abstract**

24 Most developed countries are confronted with rising rates of diseases related to unhealthy eating
25 habits, in particular, an excessive consumption of salt, saturated fat and free sugars. However,
26 saturated fat, sugars and salt in food influence not only its nutritional qualities but also its
27 sensory properties, safety (*e.g.* shelf-life) and affordability. The main challenge is to formulate
28 healthier foods which are acceptable to consumers. In this context, the overall objective of
29 *TeRiFiQ* was to achieve significant binary reductions in the salt-fat and sugar-fat contents of
30 frequently consumed food products around Europe, whilst at the same time ensuring the
31 products' nutritional and sensorial qualities, safety and affordability for both industry and
32 consumers were not compromised. *TeRiFiQ* addressed four major food categories: cheeses,
33 processed meat, bakery and sauce products. Different strategies adapted to each food category
34 were used to significantly reduce the target ingredients. Significant reductions in the salt-fat
35 and fat-sugar contents of a number of cheese, processed meat, bakery and sauce products were
36 achieved and these changes were found to be acceptable to consumers. The most promising
37 reformulated food products were developed at the industrial scale.

38

39 **Keywords:**

40 Food, fat, sugar, sodium, perception, consumer

41

42

43 **Introduction**

44

45 Most developed countries are confronted with rising rate of diseases due to unhealthy eating habits,
46 particularly the excessive consumption of salt, fat (in particular saturated fat) and free sugars (Campbell
47 *et al.* 2011; EFSA 2010; EFSA 2011). Healthcare costs could be reduced and health of people around
48 the world improved if people significantly reduced the amount of salt, saturated fat and sugars in their
49 everyday diet. Dairy, bakery, meat and ready-to-eat products are significant contributors to intake of
50 these nutrients and public health organisations typically provide specific recommendations about
51 limiting certain types of these foods (Dietary Guideline Advisory Committee 2010, WHO 2007).

52 The salt, saturated fat and sugars contents of foods influence their structure, safety, and nutritional
53 quality. These ingredients are also linked to multiple sensory characteristics of a food including its
54 texture, flavour and mouthfeel, which have a large impact on food acceptability and therefore on
55 consumer preferences. Consequently, reducing or substituting the salt, saturated fat and sugars content
56 of a food will affect many of its properties and strategies need to be tailored to each particular product
57 to ensure that its desirable properties remain and the reformulated food is acceptable to the consumer.

58 In this context, the overall objective of *TeRiFiQ* (Technologies to achieve significant binary reductions
59 in sodium, fat and sugar content in everyday foods whilst optimising their nutritional quality;
60 www.terifiq.fr), a €3 million multidisciplinary project funded by the European Commission under
61 Framework Programme 7, was to achieve significant binary reductions in sodium-fat and fat-sugar
62 contents of frequently consumed food products around Europe, whilst ensuring their nutritional and
63 sensorial qualities, safety and affordability for both industry and consumers were maintained in order to
64 support wide adoption of the project technology at European scale. *TeRiFiQ* addressed the four major
65 food categories responsible for sodium, fat and/or free sugars intake: cheeses, processed meat, bakery
66 products and sauces.

67 *TeRiFiQ* focused on binary reductions in sodium-(saturated) fat and sugars-(saturated) fat, as far as
68 possible, as these components interact at the physicochemical and sensory levels. In addition to the
69 technological development of reformulated foods, studies were conducted to improve the understanding
70 of factors that influence consumer perception and consumer acceptance. This included temporal flavour
71 release and temporal perception studies in relation to food matrix composition. Moreover, a cognitive
72 approach, consisting mainly of the study of cross-modal taste-aroma interactions, was carried out to
73 explore whether the addition of aromas could compensate for reductions in salt, sugars and/or saturated
74 fat. The findings were transferred into the new food processes.

75 The project started in January 2012 and ended in December 2015. Its organisation is presented in Figure
76 1. The first three years were dedicated to the development of the reformulated products in the laboratory.

77 In the fourth year, the reformulated products were produced at an industrial scale and evaluated by the
78 consumer in real-life conditions. The SME partners provided support throughout. For each food product,
79 reductions in the amount of sodium, fat and sugars contents, the strategies used to achieve this, and
80 consumer acceptability of the reformulated products are summarised in Table 1.

81

82 **Reducing salt and saturated fat in dairy products**

83 Salt (sodium chloride) has many important functional roles in cheese (Guinee 2004; Guinee &
84 O'Kennedy 2007). *TeRiFiQ* examined the effects of salt reduction in three cheese types (soft, semi-hard
85 and hard cheeses) on maturation processes and flavour quality. Solutions to correct the consequences of
86 a salt decrease (*e.g.* impact on flavour) in each cheese category were proposed in order to maintain the
87 acceptability of the products.

88 The primary role of salt in cheese is to regulate fermentation which drives the ripening process (lipolysis,
89 proteolysis, lactates fermentations, opening *etc.*) and, as a consequence, influences the quality of the
90 cheese (*i.e.* its texture, taste and aroma). The successive fermentations performed by the lactic acid
91 bacteria starters and then by the ripening microflora are controlled by salt, which affects the survival of
92 bacterial cells as well as the activity of the enzymes that are in direct contact with the cheese micro-
93 environment. Thus, the level of salt can affect both proteolysis and lipolysis, which are the main
94 biochemical events that determine the cheese's texture and flavour. Higher rates of proteolysis was
95 confirmed in cheeses with lower levels of salt but the results obtained in commercial low salt (-30%)
96 Trappist (semi-hard cheese), Emmental, Brie and Raclette showed a lower effect on lipolysis than
97 predicted. On the other hand, the lipolysis was higher in low salt (-30%) Brie cheese.

98 The salt reduction (-30%) in semi-hard cheese (Raclette and Trappist) and soft cheese with moulds
99 (Brie) had minimal effects on texture, taste, and aromas and thus did not modify the overall sensory
100 quality and acceptability. However, in winter, butyric acid fermentation in low salt Trappist cheese was
101 found to result in flavour defects, but this was corrected with the addition of egg lysozyme to the milk.
102 In Boû d'Fagne cheese (soft cheese with smear), the salt reduction led to the unwanted presence of white
103 moulds (*Penicilium camembertii*) and no corrective solution was found. In addition, the simultaneous
104 reduction of salt and saturated fatty acids (and corresponding increase in unsaturated fatty acids by 8%)
105 was tested in Brie cheese and this also showed only a small impact on its sensory and physicochemical
106 properties. Thus, it is possible to make Brie-type cheese with low salt content (-30%) and modified fat
107 composition with acceptable sensory and nutritional qualities.

108 Another promising way to lower the salt and fat content of dairy products while maintaining consumer
109 acceptance is through the addition of aromas. Aroma and taste are integrated at the central level (in the

110 brain) and the addition of aromas can be used to compensate for lower taste quality (Salles 2006; Small
111 & Prescott 2005). In experimental dairy products, the sardine aroma (a salt associated aroma) was shown
112 to significantly increase the perception of salty taste in most products and the butter aroma (a fat
113 associated aroma) enhanced the perception of fat content to varying degrees depending on the product
114 type (Syarifuddin *et al.* 2016). This flavour-enhancing strategy was tested on a real semi-hard cheese
115 (Trappist, Orval) with reduced salt content (-30%) (Syarifuddin 2015). With this cheese, the sardine
116 aroma was found to enhance the perception of salty taste but the enhancement of fat content perception
117 was only achieved by mixing the sardine and butter aromas. Thus, aroma addition alone or in
118 combination with other strategies can assist the dairy industry when reformulating lower-salt and lower-
119 fat foods while maintaining consumer acceptability.

120

121 **Reducing salt and saturated (and overall) fat in dry meat products**

122 In dry-fermented sausages, salt ensures microbiological safety by decreasing water activity (*i.e.* water
123 in food which is not bound to food molecules and therefore supports the growth of bacteria, yeast and
124 fungi), as well as influencing the drying process by drawing water from the product. Salt also affects
125 biochemical reactions such as proteolysis, lipolysis, oxidation and fermentation. Combined salt and fat
126 reductions in dry-fermented sausages were found to strongly impact on physicochemical characteristics,
127 leading to more proteolysis, and less lipolysis and oxidation (Safa *et al.* 2015). Combined partial
128 substitutions of animal fat and sodium chloride with vegetable oil and potassium chloride led to globally
129 acceptable levels of water loss and water activity and similar rates of proteolysis, lipolysis and lipid
130 oxidation, but less protein oxidation (Safa *et al.* 2016). Thus, this research confirmed that healthier dry
131 sausages can be manufactured with no adverse effect on end-product physicochemical and biochemical
132 properties.

133 However, reducing the amount of salt and fat added during dry-fermented sausage manufacture resulted
134 in sensory changes that lowered consumer acceptability (Safa 2016; Safa *et al.* 2015). Study of the key
135 aroma compounds showed that flavourings added during the process (mainly garlic) contributed to about
136 33% of the perceived aromatic intensity. Adding more aromatics was found to not only enhance aroma
137 acceptability but also activate fermentation processes (mainly black pepper) that improved texture
138 acceptability. Further research found that the reduced perception of the saltiness of the lower salt dry-
139 fermented sausage, caused by lowering the sodium chloride content, was fully restored by replacing
140 sodium with potassium and, although the low fat dry-fermented sausages were perceived as less soft and
141 more firm, this was not considered unpleasant by consumers because of an increased perception of
142 'meaty flavour'. Also, the addition of fatty-aromas was found to enhance the perceived 'fatty flavour'
143 of the low fat dry-fermented sausages. Overall, the research led to a 70% and 35% reduction in saturated

144 fatty acids and salt respectively in dry-fermented sausages, and a 60% saturated fatty acid reduction and
145 40% sodium reduction in chorizo. This indicates that the salt and saturated fat content of dry-fermented
146 sausages can be significantly reduced using combinations of strategies with limited adverse effects on
147 colour, textural properties and consumer acceptability.

148

149 **Reducing salt and fat in cooked meat products**

150 Cooked sausages mostly contain lean muscle, salt, fat and binders. The technological function of salt is
151 mainly to improve protein and water binding (Desmond 2007) and therefore reduce water activity. It
152 affects the macro- and micro-structure of the sausage and influences the physicochemical and sensory
153 characteristics. Different strategies to reduce overall fat and salt contents of cooked sausages were
154 explored. Concerning fat reduction, the use of sunflower oil emulsion to replace pork fat was found to
155 result in an off-taste, which was not acceptable to consumers. Another alternative to reduce fat content
156 in cooked sausages was to use lean meat, low in fat, instead of the fatty pork meat currently used;
157 however, this has implications for affordability as lean meat is more costly. Reducing the salt content of
158 the sausage batters was found to lead to increase overall cooking loss (water, proteins) and to a softer
159 texture, due to weaker binding of the mixture. The use of pre-rigor meat, which has better binding
160 properties than post-rigor meat due to its higher pH level, is a promising method to compensate for the
161 reduced binding in lower salt sausages. Consumer acceptance of sausages with a combined 20% salt
162 reduction and 24% fat reduction was similar to a standard sausage. However, when the consumers were
163 informed about these reductions, the liking of the reformulated sausages was significantly reduced in
164 line with a body of psychological research showing that expectations about a food impacts on the
165 perception of flavour and pleasantness. To increase the acceptability of low-salt sausage, the effect of
166 partially replacing sodium chloride with potassium chloride was explored. This approach resulted in
167 only small differences in perceived texture and saltiness between the low salt sausage and the non-
168 reformulated product, which minor technological adjustments in the production process are likely to
169 resolve. At the industrial level, it was possible to substitute 20-30% of the sodium with potassium and
170 decrease the total animal fat content by 25% without influencing the perceived sensory properties of the
171 cooked sausages.

172 **Reducing salt, sugars and fat in sauces**

173 To reduce the saturated and overall fat, salt and sugars contents in sauces for ready-prepared sauces,
174 multiple water-in-oil-in-water (w1/o/w2) emulsions were developed (Trif *et al.* 2016). Multiple w1/o/w2
175 emulsions can be used to reduce the fat in products while retaining consumer acceptability. They consist
176 of an inner aqueous phase (w1), trapped as small droplets inside larger oil droplets (o), which are
177 subsequently dispersed into another aqueous phase (w2) by high speed mixing. By introducing small

178 aqueous droplets in the oil droplets, the amount of oil is decreased while maintaining the same oil droplet
179 surface area. These emulsions can also modulate temporal flavour release and thus can indirectly
180 influence sweetness and saltiness perception. However, stability problems during food processing may
181 occur (Oppermann *et al.* 2015). Gelation of the inner aqueous phase w1 by gelatine or whey protein
182 isolate has been found to significantly increase stability and yield of w1/o/w2 multiple emulsions after
183 preparation in term of storage, shear constraint and heat treatment compared to reference emulsions.
184 Using this technique, fat reduction by up to 47% can be achieved with multiple emulsions while
185 maintaining or even enhancing the sensory perception of fat-related attributes in the product, such as
186 thickness, creaminess and fattiness (Oppermann *et al.* 2017). This indicates that the sensory perception
187 of the emulsions may be mainly determined by the total oil droplet surface area. Sunflower oil was to
188 make the w1/o/w2 emulsions for reformulation of the sauces, but emulsions can be prepared from
189 diverse fat sources. These w1/o/w2 emulsions were found to be sensitive to osmotic and chemical stress,
190 as is usually the case for reduced salt and sugar formulations. The resistance of the w1 droplets to
191 osmotic stress was improved by transforming the w1 droplets into a gel (alginate or carrageenan based
192 polymer), leading to a stable double emulsion gel in oil in water (g/o/w) during the product processing
193 (Oppermann *et al.* 2015, Perez-Moral *et al.* 2014).

194 The reduction of salt in tomato-based sauce products was achieved by the addition of yeast extract,
195 micronized salt, modified potassium chloride, garlic flavour and/or herbs, which enhanced consumers'
196 perception of salty flavour. The efficacy of reducing the sugar content of sauces by adding stevia extract
197 was tested on the low fat sauces prepared with double emulsions g/o/w. All these approaches had no
198 effect on the double emulsion g/o/w stability and on the shelf-life of the product.

199 Using a combination of these strategies, tomato sauces with 20% reduction in sodium and 30% reduction
200 in fat, and sweet creams with 30% reduction in sugar and 30% reduction in fat were produced.
201 Consumers were unable to detect any sensory differences between the original and reformulated
202 products.

203

204 **Reducing sugars and fat in bakery products**

205 In sweet bakery products, such as muffins, fat helps to incorporate air bubbles into the batter during
206 mixing, leaven the product, tenderise the crumb, impart moistness and enhance mouthfeel. Sugar is
207 responsible for the sweet taste, Maillard browning and many other properties related to the structure and
208 texture. The main consequence of reducing sugar is a lower viscosity of the batter which leads to less
209 air retention, thus lower aeration of the crumb. Concurrently, a reduction in sugar content leads to higher
210 availability of water, which lowers the protein denaturation and starch gelatinisation temperature.
211 Research conducted as part of *TeRiFiQ* indicated that considerable overall fat reductions in muffins did

212 not have a strong influence on its textural properties. Discrimination sensory tests were conducted with
213 naïve consumers to determine the fat and sugar reduction levels that can be achieved without consumers
214 perceiving differences in sensory properties. Simultaneous reduction by 40% for fat and 10% for sugar
215 were possible without consumers perceiving differences relative to the standard muffins. The use of
216 water-in-oil-in-water (w1/o/w2) multiple emulsions, as described above, is also a potential method for
217 the reduction of fat in bakery products

218 The production of reduced fat and sugar muffins at an industrial scale was achieved using inulin as a fat
219 and sugar replacer. This achieved simultaneous reduction of 25% fat and 25% sugar without any
220 perceived differences in sensory properties in comparison with the regular muffin. A similar strategy
221 with different types of inulin, polydextrose or waxy starch was successfully used in the production of
222 Madeleines, a traditional sponge cake. An enhancement in perception of sweetness of sugar reduced
223 products was also successfully achieved by the addition of specific sweetness-associated aroma
224 compounds.

225

226 **Consumer experiences with the reformulated foods**

227 The most promising reformulated food products of the *TeRiFiQ* project were produced at an
228 industrial level and consumer acceptability was examined in real-life and laboratory settings
229 (Romagny *et al.* 2017) (Table 2).

230 One hundred and forty four consumers were recruited for the study, which used a cross-over
231 design with each consumer provided with two bags of food products, the first to be consumed
232 at home over a two-week period, followed by a two week interval, after which the second bag
233 of products was consumed at home over the final two-week period. One bag contained
234 reformulated foods developed in *TeRiFiQ*: lower salt lower fat Chorizo and low salt low fat
235 dry-fermented sausages (Boadas), low salt low fat cooked sausages (Leiv Vidar), low salt semi-
236 hard cheese (Orval) and low sugar low fat muffins (Millba). The other bag contained
237 corresponding non-reformulated foods. Subjects were free to prepare and eat the samples as
238 they pleased. When consuming the products at home, they were required to rate the pleasantness
239 of the foods and consider the price they would be willing to pay for each. Following these
240 evaluations, the real price was revealed and subjects were instructed to re-evaluate the price
241 they were willing to pay.

242 Results indicated that the reformulated chorizo and dry sausages products were rated as more
243 pleasant than the non-reformulated products. For the semi-hard cheese and muffins, no

244 difference in pleasantness was found between the reformulated and non-reformulated versions.
245 Only the reformulated cooked sausages were considered less pleasant than the non-
246 reformulated versions and this was mainly due to textural differences. The amount that subjects
247 were willing to pay for the reformulated chorizo and dry sausages was about 12% higher than
248 for the non-reformulated versions. For the semi-hard cheese, cooked sausages and muffins, no
249 difference in the amount that participants were willing to pay was found between the
250 reformulated and non-reformulated versions. Thus, for most of the products reformulated in the
251 *TeRiFiQ* project, reformulation at least maintained consumer acceptability in real-life
252 conditions.

253 In a follow up session in the laboratory, the participants were asked to rank reformulated and
254 non-reformulated products along with other similar commercially available products
255 (trademark and store-brand) in order of their pleasantness. There was no difference in ranked
256 order of pleasantness between the reformulated and non-reformulated versions of the semi-hard
257 cheeses and muffins. Moreover, both reformulated and non-reformulated muffins were ranked
258 higher than the other commercial muffin products. The reformulated chorizo and dry sausages
259 were ranked higher than the non-reformulated versions and were considered to be similar in
260 pleasantness to the store brand version. However, the reformulated cooked sausages were
261 ranked lower than the non-reformulated versions, and the store and the trademark brands.
262 Surprisingly, in most cases, the trademark versions tended to be ranked lower in pleasantness
263 than the store brand versions.

264

265 **Conclusion**

266 *TeRiFiQ* showed that the binary reduction approach (sodium/fat and sugar/fat) can be used to
267 reduce the amount of sodium, fat and sugars in categories of foods that contribute significantly
268 to intake of these nutrients in Europe, and sensory manipulations can be used to compensate for
269 any changes in consumer acceptability. For most food products studied in *TeRiFiQ*,
270 reformulation maintained the sensory quality of the products and consumer acceptability.
271 Moreover, the reformulated products maintained their competitiveness in the market. Based on
272 the findings of the *TeRiFiQ* project, the following recommendations are made.

273 - The use of double emulsion is a promising strategy to significantly reduce the fat content of
274 various foods while maintaining consumer acceptability. This strategy might be transferable, at
275 the industrial level, to fat-rich liquid or semi-liquid matrices such as mayonnaises, soups, sweet

276 and salty sauces, and to fat-rich solid matrices such as bakery products. However, regulatory
277 and additional cost aspects should be taken into account.

278 - There is no universal strategy to the reduction of salt, fat and sugars in foods; instead strategies
279 need to be adapted and fine-tuned to support the functional properties and flavour of individual
280 target foods. In most of the cases the ambitious reduction targets were reached with a good
281 acceptability of the reformulated products by consumers.

282 - Reformulation resulting in only minor changes to the original/traditional product is generally
283 well accepted by consumers. However, consumer acceptance of the reformulation of traditional
284 products is product and innovation type dependent (see FP6 'Truefood' project;
285 www.truefood.eu).

286 - The strategies developed in *TeRiFiQ* can be translated and applied at industrial scale, but
287 additional costs may occur due to additional processing steps. The SMEs involved in *TeRiFiQ*
288 were able to develop new reformulated food products which were competitive in the market.
289 Some of these reformulated products are already available in Europe.

290

291

292 **Acknowledgements**

293 The *TeRiFiQ* project was supported by the European Union through the Seventh Framework
294 Programme: Combining Technologies to achieve significant binary Reductions in Sodium, Fat
295 and Sugar content in everyday foods whilst optimising their nutritional Quality (*TeRiFiQ*
296 Project) FP7 KBBE2011-5-289397. Seventeen partners were involved in *TeRiFiQ*: Institut
297 National de la Recherche Agronomique (FR), Association de Coordination Technique pour
298 l'Industrie Agroalimentaire (FR) with Actalia, Association pour le Développement de
299 l'Industrie de la Viande and Institut des corps gras (ITERG) as third parties, Nofima Mat AS
300 (NO), Wageningen University (NL), Institute of Food Research (UK), INRA Transfert (FR)
301 and among them, 11 European small-to-medium enterprises (SMEs) (Association pour le
302 Développement, la Recherche et l'Innovation Agroalimentaire (FR), Boadas (ES), Centre for
303 innovative process engineering (CENTIV, DE), Chazal Groupe (FR), Federalimentare Servizi
304 (IT), Herve (BE), Leiv Vidar AS (NO), Millba AS (NO), NIZO Food Research BV (NL),
305 Brasserie d'Orval SA (BE), Sativa (RO). *TeRiFiQ* covered nine EU countries: Belgium, France,
306 Germany, Italy, The Netherlands, Norway, Romania, Spain and the UK. The project was
307 coordinated by INRA.

308

309 **References**

310

311 Campbell N, Correa-Rotter R, Neal B *et al.* (2011) New evidence relating to the health impact
312 of reducing salt intake. *Nutrition, Metabolism and Cardiovascular Diseases* **21**: 617-19.

313 Dietary Guidelines Advisory Committee (2010) *Report of the Dietary Guidelines Advisory*
314 *Committee on the Dietary Guidelines for Americans to the Secretary of Agriculture and the*
315 *secretary of health and human services*. Washington DC, USA: US Department of
316 Agriculture, Agriculture Research Service.

317 Desmond E (2007) Reducing salt in meat and poultry products. In: *Reducing salt in foods:*
318 *Practical strategies*, (D Kilcast & F Angus eds.), pp. 233-55. Woodhead Publishing Limited:
319 Cambrigde, UK.

320 EFSA (European Food Safety Authority) (2010) Scientific Opinion on establishing Food-Based
321 Dietary Guidelines. *EFSA Journal* **8 (3)**: 1460.

322 EFSA (European Food Safety Authority) (2011) Scientific Opinion on the substantiation of
323 health claims related to foods with reduced amounts of sodium and maintenance of normal
324 blood pressure. *EFSA Journal* **9 (6)**: 2237.

325 Guinee TP (2004) Salting and the role of salt in cheese. *International Journal of Dairy*
326 *Technology* **57**: 99-109.

327 Guinee TP & O'Kennedy BT (2007) Reducing salt in cheese and dairy products. In: *Reducing*
328 *salt in foods: Practical strategies*, (D Kilcast & F Angus eds.), pp. 316-57. Woodhead
329 Publishing Limited: Cambrigde, UK.

330 Oppermann AKL, Renssen M, Schuch A *et al.* (2015) Effect of gelation of inner dispersed
331 phase on stability of (w(1)/o/w(2)) multiple emulsions. *Food Hydrocolloids* **48**: 17-26.

332 Oppermann AKL, Verkaaik LC, Stieger M *et al.* (2017) Influence of double (w1/o/w2)
333 emulsion composition on lubrication properties. *Food & function*, in press, DOI:
334 10.1039/C6FO01523A.

335 WHO (World Health Organization) (2007) *Reducing Salt Intake in Populations: Report of a*
336 *WHO Forum and Technical Meeting*. Geneva Switzerland.

337 Perez-Moral N, Watt S & Wilde P (2014) Comparative study of the stability of multiple
338 emulsions containing a gelled or aqueous internal phase. *Food Hydrocolloids* **42**: 215-222.

339 Romagny S, Ginon E & Salles C (2017) Impact of reducing fat, salt and sugar in commercial
340 foods on consumer acceptability and willingness to pay in real tasting conditions: A home
341 experiment. *Food Quality and Preference* **56**: 164-172.

342 Safa H (2016) *Réduction combinée en chlorure de sodium et en matière grasse animale lors de*
343 *la fabrication du saucisson sec*. Unpublished PhD thesis, University Blaise Pascal -
344 Clermont II Clermont-Ferrand, France.

345 Safa H, Berdagué JL & Mirade, PS (2015) Physicochemical properties and sensory attributes
346 of new formulations of dry-fermented sausages. In Paper Presented to the 61st International
347 Congress of Meat Science and Technology Clermont-Ferrand, France.

348 Safa H, Gatellier P, Berdagué JL *et al.* (2016) Physicochemical, biochemical and instrumental
349 attributes and consumer acceptability of dry-fermented sausages elaborated with combined
350 partial substitutions of sodium chloride and pork backfat. *Food and Nutrition Sciences* **7**:
351 1297-1314.

352 Safa H, Gatellier P, Lebert A *et al.* (2015) Effect of Combined Salt and Animal Fat Reductions
353 on Physicochemical and Biochemical Changes During the Manufacture of Dry-Fermented
354 Sausages. *Food and Bioprocess Technology* **8**: 2109-2122.

355 Salles C (2006) Odour-taste interactions in flavour perception. in *Flavour in food* (A Voilley,
356 & PX Etiévant eds.), pp. 345-368. Woodhead Publishing Limited: Cambridge, UK.

357 Small DM & Prescott J (2005) Odor/taste integration and the perception of flavor. *Experimental*
358 *Brain Research* **166**: 345-357.

359 Syarifuddin, A (2015) *Multisensory integration as a strategy to compensate for sodium and fat*
360 *reduction in food*. Unpublished PhD thesis, University of Bourgogne Franche-Comté, Dijon
361 France.

362 Syarifuddin A, Septier, C, Salles, C *et al.* (2016) Reducing salt and fat while maintaining taste:
363 An approach on a model food system. *Food Quality and Preference* **48**: 59-69.

364 Trif M, Csutak E, Perez-Moral N *et al.* (2016) *TeRiFiQ* EU Project: Multiple gel oil in water
365 emulsions as fat replacers in sauces and ready prepared foods. *Bulletin UASVM Food*
366 *Science and Technology* **73**: 47-48.

367

368

369 Figure 1: Organisation of *TeRiFiQ* project

370

371

372

373 Logo of *TeRiFiQ* project

374



375

376

Table 1: Strategies used to reduce the sodium, fat and sugar in cheeses, processed meat products, bakery products and sauces. Reformulated products acceptable (+) and not acceptable (-) to consumers

Products	Sodium*	Fat*	Sugar*	Approach	Consumer acceptability
<u>Cheeses</u>					
Raclette	-14% -29%			Adjustment of process parameters (e.g; involving Brine composition, time...)	+
Brie	-16% -24%			Adjustment of process parameters (e.g; involving Brine composition, time...)	+
Trappist	-27%, -36%			Adjustment of process parameters (e.g; involving Brine composition, time...)	+
Smear soft cheese	-10%			Adjustment of process parameters (e.g; involving Brine composition, time...)	-
Brie	-30%	-8%**		Use of milk higher in unsaturated fatty acids achieved by changing the cow's diet	+
<u>Processed meat products</u>					
Cooked sausages	-20%	-24%		Use of inulin, pre-rigour meat	+
Dry sausages	-35%	-70%§		Use of potassium chloride, yeast extracts, flavouring, sunflower oil, emulsions, fibres, lean meat	+
Chorizo	- 40%	-60%§		Use of potassium chloride, yeast extracts, flavouring, sunflower oil, emulsions, fibres, lean meat	+
<u>Bakery products</u>					
Muffins		-40%	-25%	Use of inulin, gelified double emulsion	+
Madeleines		-30%	-30%	Use of polydextrose, double emulsion	+
<u>Sauces</u>					
Tomato sauce for Pizza	-20%	-30%		Use of salt replacers, gelified double emulsion	+

Sweet cream	-30%	-30%	Use of stevia, aromas, gelified double emulsion	+
-------------	------	------	---	---

* The % indicates the main reductions achieved during the project for the overall fat content.

**The value corresponds to saturated fat content lowered in Brie cheese although total fat was unchanged.

§ The values correspond to saturated and overall fat contents lowered in the dry meat products.

Table 2: Pleasantness, willingness to pay and sorting task scores for the non-reformulated products (NR) and the reformulated products (R)

Product (Composition of a shopping-bag)	Pleasantness R/NR	WTP R/NR	Sorting task (liking)
Semi-hard cheese (200g)	=	=	NR = R > Store brand = Trademark
Dry sausages (75g)	>	>	R = Store brand > Trademark > NR
Chorizo (40g)	>	>	R > Store brand > NR = Trademark
Cooked sausages (400g)	<	=	Store brand = Trademark = NR > R
Muffin (200g)	=	=	NR = R > Store brand = Trademark

=: score not significantly different; >: higher score; <: lower score

(Figure 1)

